





# 2013 High-Level Dialogue Series

# TOWARDS THE **2013 HIGH-LEVEL DIALOGUE ON INTERNATIONAL MIGRATION AND DEVELOPMENT:**

# Assessing the effects of international migration on sustainable development and Identifying relevant priorities in view of the preparation of the Post-2015 Development Framework

#### **BACKGROUND PAPER**

Dr Khalid Koser, Deputy Director and Academic Dean, Geneva Centre for Security Policy

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

- 1. This is the first in a series of four background papers drafted to support preparatory round tables organized to help prepare Permanent Missions at United Nations (UN) Headquarters for the upcoming 2013 UN High Level Dialogue on International Migration and Development. Focusing on the effects of migration on all three pillars of sustainable development economic, social and environmental and the role for migration in the post-2015 development agenda, this paper presents a concise review of recent research, thinking and policy, highlights gaps, and identifies key questions, in order to provide the basis for discussion and debate.
- 2. In considering the linkages between migration and development in countries of origin, greatest attention in research and policy has been paid to the role of remittances. According to World Bank estimates, officially-recorded remittances were US\$381 billion in 2011 and expected to reach \$406 billion in 2012, and comprise a significant proportion of GDP in many developing countries. There is strong empirical evidence from a wide variety of developing countries that remittances can reduce and insure against poverty at the family level, contribute to human capital formation, increase access to education and health, promote rural economic development, create multiplier effects in local economies, help achieve national development goals and a positive fiscal balance, and provide resilience against natural disasters, conflict and economic downturns. There is also some evidence of negative effects, including 'Dutch disease' that, among other things, chokes off exports.
- There are other significant linkages between migration and development in countries of origin.
   Migration may relax pressure on the labour market; diasporas can make significant contributions to economic, social, and political development; temporary, periodic (including

- circular) and permanent return may also contribute important skills, innovation and investments towards development at home. Among the potentially negative impacts are the skills gaps left by the departure of educated, qualified persons, and the implications of the absence of parents for the well-being of children.
- 4. There is far less research on the impact of migration on development on destination countries in the developing world, which is a significant gap given the scale of South-South migration. There may be an argument to refocus the migration and development agenda to pay greater attention to destination countries in the Global South. Evidence from the developed world is that migration has generally positive economic and fiscal effects, but it is not clear to what extent these potential benefits translate to developing country contexts, although there is evidence that the movement of people between countries within the same region can enhance economic growth across the region for both countries of origin and destination. A much stronger evidence-base is required to demonstrate the impact of migration on development in developing countries of destination, including through expanding Migration Profiles. There is even less research on the impact of migration in transit countries, although there is evidence that migrants often work in transit countries, albeit often as undocumented workers.
- 5. The relationship between migration and the environment is complex, and the implications of climate change for migration has attracted particular research and policy attention. There are at least five aspects of the relationship between climate change and migration that are directly relevant for development outcomes and policies. First, the effects of climate change may exacerbate the disparities in development and human security that underlie much contemporary migration, and as a result it is expected that the overall scale of migration will increase. Second, many of those who are forced to move as a result of the effects of climate change will be in a vulnerable situation, and responsibility for providing protection and assistance, and finding durable solutions, will mainly fall on governments in the developing world. Third, migration and displacement as a result of the effects of climate change may exacerbate other challenges to sustainable development, especially related to urban planning and urban development. Fourth, the prospect of large-scale migration as a result of the effects of climate change has implications for development policies including disaster risk reduction policies and National Adaptation Plans of Action. Fifth, in certain circumstances, migration may place significant strains on local environments.
- 6. As the UN prepares its post-2015 development agenda, there is a growing consensus that migration should be integrated into that agenda. It is clear that migration can contribute significantly to poverty reduction and sustainable development; many of the processes underlying these development linkages can be expected to increase in the future; and migration can also contribute to wider development goals such as access to education and health and the empowerment of women. There are also development linkages outside the focus of this paper but that may further justify addressing migration in the post-2015 development agenda, including the linkages between internal migration and development, and growing multilateral cooperation on migration that may serve as a model for international partnerships on other development issues.

7. It is still unclear what the next global development agenda will look like, and the way it is framed will affect the extent to which, and how migration may be integrated. A number of options have been identified as 'entry points' for promoting the inclusion of migration in the post-2015 development agenda, including the UN Secretary-General's High Level Panel; the UN Development Group's series of 'global conversations' on the post-2015 agenda; the High Level Dialogue; the Open Working Group; and a range of other fora including the 2014 meeting of the Global Forum on Migration and Development, the World Economic Forum Global Agenda Council on Migration, the Global Migration Group, the 2014 UN Review of the International Conference on Population and Development Programme of Action, and meetings of the governing bodies of relevant international organizations.

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

This is the first in a series of four background papers drafted to support preparatory round tables organized to help prepare Permanent Missions at United Nations (UN) Headquarters for the 3-4 October 2013 UN High Level Dialogue on International Migration and Development. Subsequent papers will focus on measures to ensure respect for and protection of the human rights of all migrants; strengthening partnerships and cooperation on international migration; and the impact of international and regional labour mobility on development; reflecting with this paper the topics agreed for the Round tables at the High level Dialogue.<sup>1</sup>

All four papers will present a concise review of recent research, thinking, and policy developments; identify concrete recommendations and priorities as appropriate; and be supported by a targeted list of key references to enable further information-gathering and analysis as required. They are intended to provide the basis for discussion and debate at the preparatory round tables, and to help inform preparation for the High Level Dialogue.

This paper is structured in four main parts. The first very briefly provides some key facts and figures about international migration that pertain to the subsequent analysis of its development implications. The second part reviews recent evidence on the effects of international migration on sustainable development in countries of origin, transit, and destination, drawing on specific case studies and examples, and including discussion on the impact of migration in origin countries on poverty reduction, access to social services, and the psycho-social well-being of family members who remain at home; and in destination countries on the impact of migration on labour markets, wages, and job creation. The third part of the paper briefly assesses the latest evidence on the complex relationship between migration and the environment, including the effects of climate change, and focuses specifically on implications for development and development policy. Based on this review and analysis, the final part of the paper identifies relevant priorities for the post-2015 UN development agenda.

# 2. MIGRATION IN THE 21<sup>ST</sup> CENTURY

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> General Assembly (2012) A7C.2/67/L.15

While detailed overviews of contemporary migration patterns and trends are available elsewhere,<sup>2</sup> a few key observations are relevant at the beginning of this paper as they directly pertain to the impact of migrants and migration on development, and are referred to in the following text.

- The most widely cited estimate for the number of international migrants worldwide is 214 million this estimate derives from a 2008 data source and almost certainly underestimates today's number. It represents about three percent of the world's population.
- In 2010, about 73 million international migrants who were born in the South were residing in the South. This number was slightly smaller than the number of international migrants originating in the South and living in the North (74 million).<sup>3</sup>
- Women and girls comprise approximately 50 percent of all migrants worldwide; and an increasing proportion of women are migrating independently rather than as family members.
- While predicting future migration has no sound statistical basis and is politically sensitive, most experts expect the total number of migrants worldwide to grow significantly by 2050, although to remain as about the same proportion of the global population.
- The implication of climate change on the scale of international migration is the focus for particular debate. Most experts expect significant new migration and displacement within and between developing countries in the next few decades.

#### 3. THE EFFECTS OF INTERNATIONAL MIGRATION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

In recent years there has been a sea-change in thinking about migration and development. For many years, the focus was on migration as a 'problem', either because it was seen as a consequence of a lack of development, or because of fears about a 'brain drain' of skilled workers. Today, there is a much greater recognition that migration can contribute to poverty reduction and development, both in origin and destination countries, as well as within regions, and that these benefits can be enhanced by policy.

Arguably the pendulum has swung too far towards a focus on how migration can impact development, and there may be merit in re-focusing debate on how development – including achieving the MDGs – may in turn impact migration.

## 3.1 Countries of Origin

# 3.1.1 The role of remittances

In considering the linkages between migration and development in countries of origin, greatest attention in research and policy has been paid to the role of remittances in reducing poverty and contributing towards local, sub-regional, and national development. According to World Bank estimates, officially-recorded remittances worldwide will total around US\$ 406 billion in 2012, a growth of 6.5 percent over the previous year. The World Bank further estimates that remittance flows may reach US\$ 534 billion by 2015. About US\$325 billion of remittance flows today are to developing countries, and

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> IOM (2010)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> UNDESA (2012)

India, China, the Philippines, Mexico, and Nigeria were the five top recipients of remittances in 2010. *In many countries, remittances comprise a significant proportion of Gross Domestic Product (GDP)* – in 2012 remittances comprised more than 25 percent of GDP in Tajikistan, Liberia, the Kyrgyz Republic, and Lesotho, for example. It is important to note that there is also a significant flow of remittances outside formal mechanisms, for example through personal contact or informal exchange and trading intermediaries, and the scale of these 'informal remittances' is impossible accurately to measure. Finally, it was estimated in 2005 that between 10 and 29 percent of remittances received in countries of the Global South are sent by migrants also located in the Global South.<sup>5</sup>

There is strong empirical evidence from a wide variety of developing countries that *remittances can increase household incomes, and reduce poverty at the family level*. A study of four districts in Bangladesh, for example, found that remittances constituted 55 percent of the overall migrant household income, <sup>6</sup> while a household survey conducted by the International Organization for Migration (IOM) and Bangladesh Bank established that 20 percent of migrant households had experienced a significant rise in household incomes as a result of remittances. <sup>7</sup> In the Pacific Islands, the poverty rate among families that include a migrant has been found to be between 55-65 percent lower than that among similar families without migrants. <sup>8</sup> Evidence from Ethiopia, <sup>9</sup> Ghana, <sup>10</sup> and Mali<sup>11</sup> shows that a proportion of remittances are often saved and can provide insurance against unexpected events, and in this way *remittances not only reduce poverty, but can be a safeguard against poverty in the future*.

Beyond poverty reduction at the individual and family levels, remittances have been found to contribute more widely to sustainable development in a number of ways. *Remittances can contribute to human capital formation*.<sup>12</sup> A variety of national and comparative international studies have shown that remittances are often spent on education.<sup>13</sup> Specifically, remittances have been found to be correlated with higher school enrolment;<sup>14</sup> more completion of schooling;<sup>15</sup> greater investment in private tuition; and the development of pro-education social norms.<sup>16</sup> *Gendered analysis of the extent to which remittances equally benefit the education of boys and girls is largely absent*, but the outcome is likely to be affected by the family and wider cultural context.

Remittances may also contribute to rural economic development, <sup>17</sup> for example by providing a flow of capital into small farms in peripheral rural areas. A study in the Philippines found that remittances were

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> World Bank (2012)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Ratha and Shaw (2007)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Siddiqui and Abrar (2003)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> IOM and Bangladesh Bank (2009)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> KNOMAD Concept Note (2012)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Mohapatra et al. (2009)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Kwankye and Anarfi (2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Ponsot and Obegi (2010)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Ratha (2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> World Bank (2006)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Bracking and Sachikonye (2009)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Ratha *et al*. (2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> UNDP (2009)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Hugo (2002)

used as capital for new commercial agricultural crops; <sup>18</sup> and in India that remittances boosted local agricultural growth. <sup>19</sup>

Remittances can create multiplier effects in the local economy. In the India case study cited in the preceding paragraph, greater production in agriculture in turn generated local demand for products such as water pumps, seeds, fertilizers and pesticides, and overall injected a new dynamism in the local market. A recent study in Bangladesh has shown how remittance income may be invested in small and medium-sized enterprises which employ local labourers.<sup>20</sup>

Remittances can also contribute to achieving national development goals. The Sixth Five Year Plan of Bangladesh, for example, identifies remittances as a major factor in helping Bangladesh reduce poverty since the 1990s. An increasing number of countries are including direct reference to migration in their Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs). An extensive review of data from 71 countries established a strong correlation between remittances and poverty reduction, and estimated that at the national level a ten percent increase in official remittances per capita results in a 3.5 percent decrease in the number of people living in poverty. At the macro-economic level, where they are received at a significant scale, remittances can help maintain a positive balance of payments, help developing countries maintain a stable economy, increase foreign exchange reserves, and service debt. In these ways remittances helped cushion the impacts of the global financial crisis on a number of developing countries, and have also been found to serve as a 'shock-absorber' after natural disasters and civil conflict. And the sixth power of the global financial crisis on a number of developing countries, and have also

While the evidence on the relationship between remittances, poverty reduction, and development, is mainly positive, it is also worth being aware of certain reservations. Remittances are not necessarily reliable – during the 2009-10 global financial crisis, for example, the volume of remittances worldwide reduced quite significantly as migrant workers around the world lost their jobs or experienced a reduction in salaries, although global remittances have since rebounded. It has also been shown that remittance behavior changes over the course of migration and household lifecycles; in other words remittances may not be sustainable. Also, money may not compensate for the psycho-social costs of migration on those left behind. Some studies have shown that the education of children has suffered rather than benefited because of the absence of one or both parents as migrants. There may be particular strains on women left at home who need to take on new responsibilities in the household as well as bring up children alone in the absence of their husbands who have migrated. Migration can also create a vacuum in the care of elderly parents, and generally disrupt family care regimes. It has also been suggested that remittances may reduce incentives for generating local employment; and increase gender disparities, and inter-household and even regional inequalities.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> McKay (2003)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Srivastava *et al.* (2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> RMMRU (2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Government of Bangladesh (2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Adams and Page (2005)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> UNDP (2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> De Haas (2007)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> UNDP (2009)

In order to try to maximize the positive effects of remittances on poverty reduction and development, and minimize potential negative outcomes, and while always recognizing that remittances are private monies, policy in recent years has tended to focus on: the monitoring, analysis, and projection of remittance flows; developing retail payment systems; reducing the transaction costs for remittance transfers; increasing financial access for individuals and households; and leveraging remittances for capital market access of financial institutions or countries.<sup>26</sup>

## 3.1.2 Other development processes

The volume of research and proliferation of policies on remittances outpaces attention to other ways that migrants and migration may contribute towards poverty reduction and development in origin countries.

Although the relationship is complex, there is evidence that in certain circumstances, the departure of migrants may benefit economic development in the country of origin. Where unemployment or underemployment is high, emigration may relax pressure on the labour market, so that some of those who are left behind and have not been working (like women, older persons, the underemployed and the hidden unemployed) can find work. Evidence from Malawi, Mexico, Mozambique, Pakistan, and the Philippines further shows that emigration can result in an increase in wages in some sectors.<sup>27</sup> At the same time, high-skilled emigration can imply a loss of public resources invested in the education and training of the migrants, and reduce productive capacity in countries of origin.<sup>28</sup>

Besides sending home money on an individual basis, *migrants can also make contributions to their countries of origin collectively*, via 'hometown associations' made up of members from a particular geographical area of origin, professional bodies, spiritual and religious bodies, and federating bodies.<sup>29</sup> In countries ranging from Albania, Bangladesh, El Salvador, Eritrea, the Philippines, Nepal, Somaliland, and Vietnam, *such collective contributions have supported community welfare for example by providing educational scholarships, running health camps, and building small-scale infrastructure from water pumps to libraries to playgrounds*. The potential of diasporas as development actors is increasingly recognized in developing countries, and more and more efforts are being made to facilitate their engagement and contributions.<sup>30</sup>

Besides their economic contribution, diasporas may also retain significant influence on politics in their country of origin, for example through absentee voting or lobbying. This indirect political influence may sometimes impact economic development. The consequences of these interventions are mixed. If it leads to violence or civil war, the local economy is harmed. Several post-war countries however demonstrate migrants' contribution to local development and stabilization. The Afghan diaspora in the USA and Europe, for example, exerts significant influence on political reforms and has played a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> IOM (2010), UNDP (2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> OECD (2007)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Ratha *et al*. (2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Siddiqui (2012)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> IOM/MPI (2012)

significant role in private sector development in Afghanistan.<sup>31</sup> Other research has shown how diasporas can create a push for political and economic reforms, democratization, increasing political and bureaucratic transparency, and the emancipation of minority groups.

Another way that migrants may contribute towards development in their origin countries is by returning there, either temporarily, periodically or permanently. There are numerous examples of members of overseas professional bodies, for example of engineers or doctors or education professionals, returning home to provide training, expertise, and support through secondment or sabbatical arrangements, either on a systematic basis or in response to a crisis or natural disaster. There is also a series of programmes, such as IOM's Migration for Development in Africa (MIDA) and Temporary Return of Qualified Nationals Programmes, designed to direct temporary return towards achieving development objectives.

Periodic return can include 'circular migration', defined at the Global Forum on Migration and Development (2007) as '...the fluid movement of people between countries, including temporary or permanent movement which, when it occurs voluntarily and is linked to labour needs of countries of origin and destination, can be beneficial to all involved.' Without underestimating challenges such as the protection of the rights of short-term migrant workers and the challenges of their reintegration back home, considerable political momentum has developed around promoting circular migration. In the specific context of development in origin countries, its advantages include the fact that human capital is not lost permanently, that circular migrants may be particularly incentivized to send home remittances to prepare for their return, and that when they do return they may bring back new skills and ideas. There has been significant policy attention to enhancing the positive impacts of circular migration in origin countries, including through labour matching and the transfer of knowledge, and establishing networks that promote trade and investment.

An alternative is to engage the diaspora through the development of knowledge networks, allowing the transfer of skills and expertise without necessitating a physical return (this is sometimes referred to as 'virtual return').

One promising avenue for strengthening the link between permanent return and development has been to support enterprise development among return migrants. There is evidence from Colombia, for example, that the participation of return migrants in small business helped stave off economic recession during the 1990s.<sup>32</sup> A number of factors have been cited in the research literature as facilitating entrepreneurial activities among returning migrant workers. One is their capacity to save while abroad. Another is their ability to create synergies with local government that often cannot be formed by foreign investors without national ties. A third factor is the scale of public and private investments in business compared to the quantity of people returning. Additional factors cited in the literature include length of time spent abroad; gender; marital status; numbers of dependents; education; and work experience. The evidence on the significance of reintegration programmes as a factor facilitating enterprise

32 Black and Castaldo (2009)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Koser (2010)

development is mixed. It has also been found that the main obstacles to enterprise development among returning migrants are constraining and restricting national policies, laws and regulations in place in the countries to which migrant workers are returning, for example concerning permits to build or employ workers.

#### 3.2 Countries of Destination

Research and policy on the links between migration and development has tended to focus on impacts on origin countries. Especially given the very significant numbers of migrants who are living and working in destination countries in the developing world (73 million – or almost half of all migrants originating in the Global South), there may be an argument to refocus the migration and development agenda to pay greater attention to destination countries in the Global South, as well as to the impacts of intra-regional labour mobility on regional economic development.

The impact of migrants and migration in developed countries is positive overall, although with some limitations. Evidence from various countries and regions has demonstrated significant economic and fiscal benefits. Skilled migrants can fill important gaps in the labour market, and help drive innovation. In the United States (U.S.) immigrants have been found to be 30 percent more likely to form new businesses than U.S.-born citizens. By providing a 'flexible workforce', lower-skilled migrants can reduce labour costs to employers and in turn keep down prices for consumers. In terms of fiscal impact, a recent review of academic research in the U.S. has demonstrated that taxes paid by immigrants and their children exceed the costs of the services they use. <sup>33</sup> Other research is less positive, suggesting that cheap immigrant labour can stifle modernization, that immigration may reduce wages for certain groups of workers, especially the low-skilled; that in areas where there is a particular concentration of migrants they may comprise a net drain on government budgets; and that migrant entrepreneurs are more likely to fail than local entrepreneurs. Besides, a focus on economic impacts ignores the social impacts of migration both on the migrants themselves as well as on host societies, which can equally be mixed.

It is not clear to what extent the potential benefits – and costs - of migrants and migration to the economies of developed countries translate to destination countries in the developing world. There is evidence that in relative terms migration increases livelihood and employment opportunities, and financial income, less for migrants to developing than developed countries, perhaps indicating that migrants are less successful there. <sup>34</sup> A significant proportion of migrants in developing countries may work informally, which will impact their overall fiscal impact. <sup>35</sup> There is evidence that where migrants are concentrated in urban areas, their presence may increase disparities and lead to the expansion of slum areas. It is also important to acknowledge that although migration may result in economic benefits, lower-skilled migrants in developing countries often have limited rights in the workplace, may experience health risks, and female migrants in particular are vulnerable to mistreatment and abuse.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Greenstone and Looney (2010)

<sup>34</sup> Siddiqui (2012)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> UNDP (2009)

The respect and protection of the human rights of migrants is considered in more detail in the second paper in this series.<sup>36</sup>

At the same time, there is evidence that the movement of people between countries within the same region can enhance economic growth across the region for both countries of origin and destination, especially by matching labour supply and demand. As a result many regional organizations either enshrine (as in the case of the European Union) the free movement of people within the region, or envisage it, as in the case of the Regional Economic Communities in Africa, as well as the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) and others.<sup>37</sup>

A much stronger evidence-base is required to demonstrate the impact of migration on development in developing countries of destination. Data on the number and profile of migrants in developing countries is improving, for example as a result of Migration Profiles, pioneered by the European Commission and carried out by IOM; the UN Population Division Global Migration Database; and the International Labour Organization (ILO) International Labour Migration database; and there is now some World Bank data on remittances between countries of the Global South. But there is certainly not a solid foundation for assessing the impact on economic growth and development of migrants in developing countries. Implementation of the recommendations of the Commission on International Migration Data for Development Research and Policy of 2009 may be a starting point.<sup>38</sup> It has also been recommended that the content of Migration Profiles should be extended to include a comprehensive range of issues relevant in the migration and development context, such as labour market conditions, income levels, human development indicators, migrants' access to rights, 'brain drain', health, diaspora, education, trade and other factors related to the impact of migration on the development of concerned countries.<sup>39</sup>

Besides data gaps, other issues that need to be addressed to better understand and enhance the impacts of migration on countries of destination include integrating understanding of migration in national planning, identifying conditions under which migration can contribute to development, and reviewing laws and regulation.<sup>40</sup>

# 3.3. Countries of Transit

There is even less evidence on which to make an assessment of the contribution of migrants and migration to development in transit countries. There is no single or widely agreed definition of transit countries in international law or policy, but they are usually defined as countries where migrants stop *en route* to their final destination. *There are a number of reasons to suppose that many migrants in transit may work there.* First, some migrants spend very considerable periods in transit countries, and it seems likely that they need to work to survive, although usually this will be work in the informal sector. Second, it is often assumed that migrants from low-income countries (for example in sub-Saharan

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Ratha and Shaw (2007)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Nita (2013)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Commission on International Migration Data for Development Research and Policy

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> IOM (2010)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> De Haas and Yaqub (2009)

Africa) who are in middle-income countries (for example in the Maghreb) are inevitably in transit and intending to head to a high-income country (for example in Europe), but this may not be the case. <sup>41</sup> The experiences of Southern and Eastern Europe show how transit countries can evolve into destination countries for migrants. Third, there is evidence that migrants in transit send back remittances, again implying that they may be working and even saving in transit. <sup>42</sup> Fourth, limited research on migrant smuggling suggests that migrants may pay for their journeys in stages, and thus often have to work in transit in order to pay for the next stage. <sup>43</sup>

Equally, far more research is required into the nature of work in transit and to what extent it may benefit the local economy. Transit migrants are usually undocumented and have low-status, and they are likely to work in the informal sector or in illegal activities. <sup>44</sup> At the same time it has been predicted that transit migration is likely to grow in significance, as the overall scale of migration increases, as a result of the proliferation of the 'migration industry', and as a result of increasing barriers to migration in higher-income countries.

#### 4. THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN MIGRATION AND THE ENVIRONMENT

There is an extensive research and policy literature on the links between migration and the environment, especially focusing on the implications of climate change for migration patterns and trends, and how to address them. Key debates concern the nature of the relationship between climate change and migration, how many people will migrate and where from and where to, and how to fill gaps in the normative and legal framework. It is not the purpose of this paper to review this literature in detail – comprehensive reviews are available elsewhere and IOM has recently published an extensive bibliography on the links between climate change and migration. Instead, this section focuses on those aspects of the relationship between climate change and migration that are directly relevant for development outcomes and policies.

First, the effects of climate change may exacerbate the disparities in development and human security that underlie much contemporary migration. Specifically, climate change will affect migration in the coming years through its influence on a range of economic, social and political drivers that themselves affect migration. Thus for example the effects of climate change may make agricultural livelihoods less sustainable; natural hazards may increase in frequency and intensity and oblige people to move; and competition over scarce resources may exacerbate conflict.

As a result, it is expected that the overall scale of migration will increase, although it will often be difficult to distinguish environmental from other factors that cause migration. Estimates for the number

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Düvell (2008)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Jacobsen *et al*. (2012)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Petros (2005)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> IPU (2005)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Piguet *et al.* (2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> IOM (2012)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Foresight (2011)

of people who may move as a result of the effects of climate change vary widely, but may number in the millions over the next 50 years.

Second, many of those who are forced to move as a result of the effects of climate change will be in a vulnerable situation, for example lacking access to shelter and work, and will require protection and assistance. Many experts predict that most displacement will take place within developing countries, and responsibility for providing protection and assistance, and finding durable solutions, will therefore fall on governments there.

Third, migration and displacement as a result of the effects of climate change may exacerbate other challenges to sustainable development. In particular it is expected that the effects of climate change will accelerate the process of urbanization, confronting cities in developing countries with a 'double jeopardy' of rapid growth combined with an increasing population of vulnerable urban migrants. In this way migration as a result of the effects of climate change will exacerbate the challenges of urban planning and urban development.

Fourth, the prospect of large-scale migration as a result of the effects of climate change has additional and significant implications for development policy. Disaster risk reduction policies need to take into account the importance of minimizing forced or unplanned migration. Sustainable development requires building the resilience of communities likely to be affected by climate change. Integrating migration into disaster risk reduction strategies and National Adaptation Plans of Action (NAPAs) will be important to try to reduce forced migration in these circumstances and minimize its negative consequences. While migration issues increasingly appear in NAPAs, there remains the need for more systematic mainstreaming of migration into development policies, at the global and specific sectoral levels; a stronger focus on the design and implementation of relevant policies; and the elaboration of specific monitoring and evaluation mechanisms. At the global level, it will be important that funding mechanisms for adaptation to climate change encompass its migration effects, including that, in some circumstances, migration can be a positive adaptation measure.

A final consideration in the complex relationship between migration, development and the environment is that *in certain circumstances, migration may place significant strains on local environments*. This is particularly the case for refugee and internally displaced populations that often settle in large numbers in rural areas, and may intensify deforestation and affect water table levels.

# 5. IDENTIFYING PRIORITIES FOR THE POST-2015 UN DEVELOPMENT AGENDA

Migration was not one of the UN Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), and it has been argued appropriately not as international agreements on migration targets would have been unlikely as they were for example on reducing poverty.<sup>51</sup> Still, migration may have helped achieve certain MDGs, for example as a result of the contribution of remittances to poverty reduction, or to health, education and

<sup>50</sup> Foresight (2011)

© IOM, UNFPA, UN DESA.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> IOM/UNDESA (2012)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Koser (2010)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Skeldon (2008)

gender empowerment-related targets. As the UN prepares its post-2015 development agenda, there is a growing debate about whether and how migration should be integrated in the agenda.

The preceding review has provided a number of arguments to support the integration of migration in the post-2015 development agenda. It has been shown that the total number of migrants is significant and is likely to grow. Even though migrants account for only about three percent of the world's population, it is clear that migration affects many more people than only the migrants themselves, including families and communities from which they came and the communities in which migrants settle, live and work. The total value of officially-recorded remittances sent home each year is enormous – some US\$ 406 billion – more than three times the annual amount of Official Development Assistance (ODA). There is substantial evidence that remittances can help reduce poverty, and contribute to development at the local, sub-regional, and even national levels. Migration demonstrably can contribute to development in other ways, for example by relaxing pressure on labour markets, through diaspora engagement and return movements, through gender and minority empowerment, improved health and education outcomes, and so on. Migration may also contribute to development in developing countries of destination, and support regional integration and economic growth.

Many of the processes underlying these development linkages may be expected to increase in the future. The scale of migration is likely to increase in absolute numbers, and the scale of remittances to also increase as a result. The rise of the global internet is accelerating the pace of technological diffusion, making it easier for individual migrants and their associations to influence and invest in their countries of origin – for example the web is predicted to become a critical tool in distributing educational content. The growing impetus towards temporary migration programmes and circular migration means that the scale of return migration – both temporary and permanent – is also likely to increase in the future.<sup>52</sup>

This review has also illustrated how migration can contribute to wider development goals. It can have social as well as economic benefits, for example by increasing access to education and healthcare and empowering women. It can create jobs and wealth, and generate trade. Migration impacts are also an integral part of adaptation plans to climate change.

Furthermore, there are development linkages that have not been the focus for this paper but that may also justify addressing migration in the post-2015 development agenda. The High Level Dialogue concentrates on the linkages between international migration and development; but there is strong evidence that internal migration — which takes place on a far more substantial scale than international migration — may also contribute towards development, especially in rural areas. While internal migration may not be a focus area for the High Level Dialogue, arguably it should be for the post-2015 development agenda. There are linkages between migration (both internal and international) and other aspects of population dynamics. And while there remain significant gaps in the global governance

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> IOM (2010)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Siddiqui (2012)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Skeldon (2008)

of international migration, it has become the subject of growing multilateral cooperation that may serve as a model for international partnerships on other development issues.<sup>55</sup>

For all of these reasons, there is an emerging consensus that the potential contribution of migration to development should be explored and integrated in the post-2015 development agenda. It is still unclear what the next global development agenda will look like, and the way it is framed will affect the extent to which, and how migration may be integrated. This raises several questions for consideration.

First, how can migration contribute both to the continued efforts of the MDGs to reduce poverty, and to the proposed elaboration of sustainable development goals?<sup>56</sup> The preceding review has suggested that migration can contribute to both overall goals, but through different processes; thus achieving them would require different migration policy emphases.

A related second question is how will migration affect in a differential manner the articulation and measurement of universal goals as well as goals that target poorer countries in particular.

A third question currently being debated is whether linkages should be made between migration and specific development targets and indicators in the post-2015 development agenda, or whether migration should be 'mainstreamed' and considered as a 'development enabler' - or potentially both.

Fourth, should the migration-related focus in setting the agenda be on reducing negative aspects of migration (for example human trafficking, migrant smuggling, and irregular migration), or promoting its positive aspects, or both. This includes consideration of the migration and environment link in the context of disaster risk reduction and efforts to address the particular needs of fragile and conflict-affected states.

A fifth, more immediate, question concerns how best to integrate the links between migration and development in the post-2015 development agenda? A number of 'entry points' have been identified, as detailed below; and a related question is whether these various initiatives may converge to create an effective platform for the inclusion of migration in the future development agenda.

• The UN Secretary-General has established a *High Level Panel* to advise on the global development agenda after 2015, which will report in the second quarter of 2013. This may provide a limited but high-level opportunity to advocate for the inclusion of a migration perspective by those governments with representation on the panel. For example, the Government of Sweden and its HLP member Development Minister Gunilla Carlson are planning an expert meeting of the HLP focused on migration, to be convened in Stockholm in February 2013. A *post-2015 UN Task Team* was established and has produced a 'roadmap' for the High Level Panel, including a 'think piece' on population dynamics – including internal and international migration, as well as a 'think piece' on migration and human mobility, prepared by IOM with input from DESA.<sup>57</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> UN System Task Team (2012)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Rosengaertner (2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> UN System Task Team (2012)

- The UN Development Group is leading efforts to catalyze a 'global conversation' on the post-2015 agenda through a wide-ranging series of consultations around a series of 11 themes, one of which is on population dynamics, including both internal and international migration. The aims of the consultation on population dynamics include learning lessons from the design and implementation of the MDGs, to consider data availability and requirements, and to consider how to monitor progress in implementation.<sup>58</sup> Its expert group meeting in November 2012 recommended that population dynamics be addressed in a holistic manner in the post-2015 development agenda, with gender-responsive policies and a focus on human development.<sup>59</sup> Civil society and private sector consultations are taking place on this theme, as are wide ranging on-line consultations, with a view to convening a Global Thematic Consultation on Population Dynamics and the post-2015 Development Agenda on 11-12 March in Dhaka, Bangladesh, cosponsored by the Governments of Bangladesh and Switzerland. With its broad-based, open and inclusive consultation process, the global thematic consultation on population dynamics seeks to harness the views and insights of a diverse set of actors, including academia, civil society, the private sector and the general public. It could also provide an important testing ground for determining how, and to what extent, the links between migration and development could be included in the 10 other thematic areas, such as inequalities, growth and employment, conflict and fragility or health.
- The Open Working Group called for by the Rio+20 outcome document is soon to begin its work
  on the elaboration of Sustainable Development Goals, and will be supported, as requested, by a
  UN Technical Support Team, which includes IOM and partner UN system entities. It is unclear
  whether and to what extent migration may feature in the work of this representative group of
  governments.
- In addition, an informal Migration/P2015 agenda working group has been established, which
  has identified as its overarching goals: to ensure that migration is given full consideration in the
  post-2015 agenda; to energize the development community to understand how migration can
  contribute to achieving their goals; to mainstream migration; and to change perceptions and
  raise awareness of migration.<sup>60</sup>
- While the High Level Dialogue is not formally part of the post-2015 development agenda-setting
  process, it has also been identified as a venue to raise the profile of the linkages between
  migration and development, including at preparatory events such as the round table for which
  this paper has been prepared.
- A range of other fora has been identified as providing opportunities for advocacy on this issue
  including the 2014 meeting of the Global Forum on Migration and Development (GFMD) to be
  hosted by Sweden, the World Economic Forum Global Agenda Council on Migration, the Global
  Migration Group (GMG), the 2014 UN Review of the International Conference on Population and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> UN Development Group (2012)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Expert Group Meeting (2012)

<sup>60</sup> Migration/P2015 Working Group (2012)

Development Programme of Action (ICPD Beyond 2014), and meetings of the governing bodies of relevant international organizations. <sup>61</sup>

#### 6. CONCLUSION

This paper is intended to provide the basis for a round table discussion to assist Permanent Missions at UN Headquarters prepare their contributions and participation at the 3-4 October 2013 UN High Level Dialogue on International Migration and Development, where one of the four agreed Round tables will focus on migration and sustainable development, including in view of the preparation of the post-2015 UN development agenda. The paper has provided a concise review of a substantial literature on the linkages between migration and development. It has highlighted gaps in the existing research and literature, for example concerning the impact of migration on gender and development, and on development in developing countries of destination. It has noted some of the negative consequences of migration – on migrants and their families and in some situations on the development process, and has summarized the main policy approaches to enhancing the development potential of migration. It has briefly outlined the main development-related issues arising from research on the complex relationship between migration and the environment. Finally it has presented an overview of the current debate concerning integration of migration in the post-2015 development agenda.

#### **REFERENCES**

Adams, R.H. and Page, J. (2005) 'Do international migration and remittances reduce poverty in developing countries?' *World Development*, 33(10):1645-69

Agunias, D. and Newland, K. (2012) 'Engaging the Asian diaspora' Issue in Brief No.7, Bangkok and Washington DC: IOM and Migration Policy Institute

Black, R. and Castaldo, A. (2009) 'Return migration and entrepreneurship in Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire: the role of capital transfers', *Tjidschfift voor Economische en Sociale Geografie*, 100(1): 44-58

Bracking, S. and Sachinkonye, L. (2009) 'Migrant remittances and household wellbeing in urban Zimbabwe', *International Migration*, 48(5): 203-27

Commission on International Migration Data for Development Research and Policy (2009), *Migrants Count: Five Steps Towards Better Migration Data*, Washington DC: Centre for Global Development

De Haas, H. (2007) 'Remittances, migration, and social development', Social Policy and Development Programme Paper No.34, Geneva: UNRISD

GFMD Ad Hoc Working Group on Policy Coherence, Data and Research (2010) 'Seminar on assessing the impacts of migration and development policies', Vienna

Global Knowledge Partnership on Migration and Development (KNOMAD) (2012) Concept Note, World Bank

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Rosengaertner (2011)

Global Migration Group (GMG) (2010) Mainstreaming Migration into Development Planning, Geneva: IOM

Government of Bangladesh (2011) Sixth Five Year Plan, Dhaka: Ministry of Planning

Greenstone, M. and Looney, A. (2010) 'Ten economic facts about immigration', Hamilton Project Policy Memo, September, Washington DC: Brookings Institution

Hugo, G. (2002) 'Effects of international migration on family in Indonesia', *Asian and Pacific Migration Journal*, 11(1): 13-46

IOM (2010) World Migration Report 2010, Geneva: IOM

IOM and Bangladesh Bank (2009) Nationwide Household Remittance Survey in Bangladesh, Dhaka: IOM

IOM and Migration Policy Institute (MPI) (2012) Roadmap for Engaging the Diaspora, Bangkok and Washington DC: IOM and MPI

Koser, K. (2010) The Contribution of Diaspora Return to Post-Conflict and Fragile Countries, Paris: OECD

Kwankye, S. and Anarfi, J. (2011) 'Migration impacts within the West African sub-region', Research Programme Consortium on Migrating Out of Poverty, Brighton: University of Sussex

McKay, D. (2003) 'Cultivating new local futures: remittances economies and land-use patterns in Ifugao, Philippines', *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*, 34(2): 285-306

Migration/P2015 Working Group (2012) Agenda

Mohapatra, S. et al. (2009) 'Remittances and natural disasters', World Bank Policy Research Working Paper No.4792, Washington DC: World Bank

Nita, S. (2013) 'Regional migration governance – a comparative review', paper presented to the conference on Regional Governance of Migration and Socio-Political Rights, Geneva, January

OECD (2007) Policy Coherence for Development: Migration and Developing Countries, Paris: OECD

Ponsot, F. and Obegi, B. (2010) 'Etude de capitalisation des initiatives et mecanismes en matiere de transferts de fonds au Mali', report prepared for the European Commission and Government of Mali

Ratha, D. and Shaw, W. (2007) South-South Migration and Remittances, Washington DC: World Bank

Ratha, D. et al. (2011) Impact of Migration on Economic and Social Development, World Bank Policy Research Working Paper, Washington DC: World Bank

RMMRU (2011) Achievements of Short Term Migrants in Enterprise Development in Bangladesh, Dhaka: RMMRU

Rosengaertner, S. (2012) 'How to go about including migration into the post-2015 UN development agenda', draft input paper for the MPI brainstorming meeting on 'Migration as an Enabler for Development, December

Siddiqui, T. (2012) Impact of Migration on Poverty and Development, Research Programme Consortium on Migrating Out of Poverty, Working Paper No.2, September, Brighton: University of Sussex

Siddiqui, T. and Abrar, C. (2003) *Migrant Workers' Remittances and Micro-Finance in Bangladesh*, Geneva: ILO

Skeldon, R. (2008) Migration Policies and the Millennium Development Goals, London: Policy Network

Srivastava, R. et al. (2011) Impact of Internal and International Migration: South Asia, Research Programme Consortium on Migrating Out of Poverty, Brighton: University of Sussex

UNDESA (2012) Population Facts 2012/3, June, New York: UNDESA

UN Development Programme (UNDP) (2011) Towards Human Resilience, New York: UNDP

UN General Assembly (2012) International Migration and Development, A7C.2/67/L.15

UN System Task Team on the Post-2015 UN Development Agenda (2012) Migration and Human Mobility: Thematic Think Piece

World Bank (2006) Economic Implications of Remittances and Migration, Washington DC: World Bank

World Bank (2012) Migration and Development Brief 19, November 2012, Washington DC: World Bank